

COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE ORFF SCHULWERK SYSTEM AND THE METHOD RECOMMENDED BY THE MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AT PRIMARY SCHOOL STUDENTS

Styliani Valasi

South-West Neofit Rilski, Blagoevgrad, Bulgaria, stellavalasi@yahoo.gr

Abstract: Music pedagogy in Greece in the 21st century is called to be redefined in order to face the challenges of the new institutional frameworks, social changes, the modern needs of the teacher and the student. German composer Carl Orff (1895-1982) has been recognized worldwide and is considered one of the most powerful and dynamic artistic personalities of the 20th century. The characteristics of the Orff method have influenced educational programs that used traditional teaching methods. The purpose of this specific study is the analysis of the basic teaching principles of music education as proposed by the Ministry of Education manual as well as Orff teaching. More specifically, the present study investigates the educational textbooks of Music Education in primary education focusing mainly on its structural characteristics compared to the Orff system. Highlighting and delineating the identity of the traditional methods of music education and the Orff method, their impact on students emerges as a difficult and interesting case. This study emerged from research involving three primary school classes. From the above, the need to define the field emerges. The semi-structured in-depth interview and observation were used as methodological tools. The choice of these two tools arose so that, on the one hand, there would be freedom for the respondent to evaluate and understand the researcher by observing the events of the group he is studying. On the one hand, the research showed that the Orff system, what is of great importance in teaching is the ingenuity of the teacher to connect the subject he is studying with the goals he is pursuing. On the other hand, based on the teaching methods, we understand that a teacher who exclusively chooses the music education textbook as a teaching method is limited based on the planned activities and therefore limits the students' creativity and imagination, which as was seen from the results of research has had higher success rates when incorporating Orff-based activities. The conclusions are focused on the usefulness of the two methods based on the response they had from the students. The research is based on a bibliographic review through articles, books, scientific works of the past and recent years.

Keywords: Music pedagogy, primary education, Orff system, Ministry of Education manual

1. INTRODUCTION

We observe that in the field of music education there is a wealth of music pedagogy methods available to primary school music teachers. Therefore, the choice of the music pedagogic method to be followed lies in the knowledge and judgment of the teacher. These practices range from traditional textbooks to technologically advanced music programs. The purpose of the study that is being conducted is to investigate the effectiveness of popular music pedagogic methods in relation to traditional learning approaches that are not governed by some of these methods (Dogan,2022). The music educator and composer Carl Orff (1895-1982) based initially on Dalcroze's ideas, gave a new impetus to the development of music education methods, adding speech to music and movement. He created "Orff - Schulwerk", a music-kinetic system of school education, with the subtitle "Elementary Music and Kinetic Education". In his pedagogy, but also in his compositional work, he treats music with the "Platonic" dimension and meaning, which places special emphasis on speech (expression of thought). The increased popularity of Orff's work (Orff Schulwerk) over other musical pedagogical approaches gave rise to some basic questions that are also the research questions of this particular study. The first research question is "How does the Orff Schulwerk approach differ from an approach provided in music education textbooks in Greece"? And the second research question is "What is the effectiveness between the two approaches"?

Although there is evidence to support and illustrate the popularity of Orff Schulwerk, there is nevertheless an inconclusive documentation of its effectiveness. The main purpose of this study is to measure the musical achievements of students of two primary schools using the Orff Schulwerk method and an approach through the school music textbooks proposed by the Greek Ministry of Education. (Poulou,2006) The Orff Schulwerk music education method is an approach to music education developed by Carl Orff and Gunild Keetman, in which students become direct participants in the process of creating music through singing, movement and playing instruments. The goal of Carl Orff's approach is independent musicality for all students, which can be achieved through various means. Orff strongly believed that the speech and song of a child's native culture were natural starting points for a child's first experiences with music. This includes nursery rhymes, children's songs and folk music, which together complement Orff's elemental style (Kotzian & Vallejo,2018).

The Traditional method according to the standards of the traditional tools of music education is an educational process that merges various approaches, including Kodály, Orff and Dalcroze, as described in the basic program of the Ministry of Education(Comeau,1995).The text provides sequential lessons in a child-centered program that incorporates a variety of learning methods. According to the interdisciplinary unified framework of music study programs, the purpose of music education is primarily the development and cultivation of the ability for aesthetic enjoyment when listening, performing and creating music as one of the manifestations of artistic expression and human creativity. Through this purpose and parallel to it, music education aims at the general cultivation of the students' creativity and personality, through active listening, music creation and performance activities. This program integrates Kodály, Orff, Dalcroze and traditional music education practices in an integrated approach. Includes high-quality age-appropriate materials with a variety of musical styles. The series offers lessons that identify and encourage the formation of concepts through a variety of learning situations. Although the traditional way of learning music includes aspects of Orff Schulwerk, there are some important differences may not generalize to all teaching situations due to teacher strengths and weaknesses(Agalianou & Alexiadi,2013)

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

The research is based on the traditional teaching model of the music education course in primary education which is part of the curriculum of the Ministry of Education and Culture. which became an occasion to point out certain criteria, based on some concerns regarding the content and the way of teaching through music-kinetic activities of the Orff method student participation in the specific subject. For the investment of the subject, the qualitative methodological approach was chosen as it contains tools that offer the flexibility for the emergence of new ideas (Strauss A. & Corbin. J. 1990). The tools used for data collection were literature research in both paper and electronic form, observation and semi-structured interviews.

On the one hand, observation gives a detailed description of the events taking place in the physical environment of a school classroom and on the other hand, interviews with music teachers would help to understand interpretations and concepts (Mason,2002). Semi-structured interviews are often preceded by observation, informal and unstructured interviews to allow researchers to develop a deep understanding of the topic of interest necessary to develop relevant and meaningful semi-structured questions.

The steps the researcher followed to conduct the research were as follows:

Approval was requested from the principals of the primary schools for the possibility of conducting research with third, fourth and fifth grade students. The researcher was also already the music teacher of the school. Consent forms were then given by the parents or guardians of the children, with which they approved the participation of their children in the research, and then the field of the study began, which was conducted from the beginning of October to the end of November of 2022. First the researcher conducted a pre-test on third, fourth and fifth grade students during the first week of October in the already scheduled music lesson to inform the students about the scope of the study. The way of comparing the two methods was carried out as follows:

Normally following the content of the music book proposed by the Ministry of Education, Research and Religious Affairs Institute of Educational Policy, pilot programs were implemented as a parallel explanation of the Orff system method.

The study was limited in the following ways:

1. The study involved students from the primary school, mainly in the third, fourth and fifth grades
2. The comparison of the two music-pedagogical methods was made through the teaching of a different song for each class which was taught in two ways: a) with the suggested method of the teacher's music book and b) with an indicative way of approaching the Orff method
3. The generalizability of the results is limited by specific characteristics of the students and the school where the study was conducted.

3. RESULTS

The findings of this research study confirm and show the necessity of changing and adapting new curricula to modern teaching methods and new perceptions of the teacher area of the science of Pedagogy.The use of Orff's music-motor education was a powerful tool for the development of children's creative skills and qualitatively upgraded the progress of the course. Each new motor action and exercise was part of the child's learning and creativity. The new elements and knowledge that emerged each time made the lesson more interesting and entertaining for the children.

The teaching method that was applied is teacher-centered and the students - especially the male students - show a negative attitude and willingness to participate, during the learning process of the traditional way of teaching music education.. This specific study proves that the traditional way of approaching music education in combination with

ways of intervention such as the Orff approach, has positive results in the development of the child's personality. On the one hand, the music education program in Greek primary schools incorporates approaches such as Dalcroze, Kodály, Orff. The specific program has an organized and structured character and focuses on the cognitive development of the child through music. It contains a rich material of songs that are studied meter, rhythm, melody, analysis of the lyrics as well as its origin. The traditional approach is designed in a simple and clear way so that a music teacher or even a general education teacher can teach a class. According to the results it emphasizes the song. Music lessons often involve the use of written assignments where the teacher assesses a student's progress. A new element that has been added to the traditional way of teaching music is the use of technological tools and digital music programs to make the lesson more fun and engaging as the new generation from their early years are familiar with electronic devices and technology in general. When in the traditional way of music teaching, the researcher who had knowledge of the Orff approach incorporated basic principles of the system, it was observed that the lesson changed form and the students felt more free and creative as they treated it as a parallel activity or as a kind of game. Therefore, the participation of the students was strengthened, the fact that in the traditional way, due to the increased listening and writing activities, they passively received the knowledge and had a smaller part of participation due to the limited time as the lesson time is defined in Greek education. The music teacher emphasized the students' contact with the instruments, especially the percussion instruments. A song or activity involved music, movement and speech (Saliba, 2017). The evidence mentioned above shows the need reforming the detailed curriculum of primary education using Orff's music-kinetic education, in order for school education to become the main body for the dissemination and rescue of cultural awareness.

4. DISCUSSIONS

This research shows how necessary it is for education to be reformed and to present new ways of intervention, in order to contribute effectively to the all-round development of the child's personality. In addition, to bring to the surface the acquired knowledge and motor experiences of the students and to strengthen their creative abilities, so that they develop within a context of satisfaction and entertainment in their social environment and greater participation in the music education course (Georgopoulou, 2020). Through the programs studies and student-centered teaching models, education could support the child's psychomotor, cognitive, creative and social-emotional development. In this way, it could form healthy, dynamic and independent individuals, able to cooperate with each other, capable cells of the living social fabric, to continue their cultural action fruitfully and creatively (Sangiorgio, 2022). Children in order to educate themselves need to recruit a variety of stimuli and experience experiences from different areas of development for a specific action issue. Thus, they have the opportunity to actively participate, to process information of their interest from different perspectives, to organize themselves, to cooperate with others and to understand more fully the chosen object of investigation. At the same time, the process of approaching a subject through an experiential way and with activities of various developmental domains, helps the child to broaden his horizons and delve deeper into the subject. Music-motor education is considered essential for children because its main purpose is the overall harmonious, spiritual and psycho-physical development, equipping them with useful knowledge and skills and offering every possible help for their smoother adaptation to the environment (Sergi, 1993). The main masses used in the Orff music-motor education are motor skills, improvised dance, rhythmic games, singing, the use of musical instruments, audio stories, dramatization fairy tales, the theatrical game and the musical-kinetic games. The lesson of music education is very important when it is approached with more active methods than other music education methods such as the Orff method, which helps to develop motor skills, to cultivate rhythm, to know the body and space, to cultivate and express emotions and finally offers satisfaction, joy and play in children. It also contributes to cooperation, teamwork, respect, discipline and friendship. The application of the Orff method should be treated with special attention by most educators as children, as shown by the results, respond positively to music-motor programs believing that music-motor education is an ongoing game, through which they are entertained, exercise, and discover new ways of expressing themselves using music and their bodies.

5. CONCLUSIONS

Music education systems were born from the need to create a pedagogical method, a more scientific and comprehensive approach to the process of teaching music, which will combine music and movement for an easier understanding of musical concepts in young children age, through which music education can draw new, effective elements that will help its development. The results of this study seem to have revealed significant differences between students taught with the Orff-Schulwerk approach and traditional music education practices in the acquisition of musical skills. We find that on the one hand the idea of the Carl Orff method gives children the possibility of freedom for inspiration and improvisation as Carl Orff avoided false simplification because he

believed that the children's world should not be treated as primitive and transitory. In general, Orff relied on the rules of European music and folk traditions. The mixing of various expressive forms in fundamental phenomena is elementary (Georgopoulou, 2020). It is an active process of progress through the internalization, elaboration and invention of musical materials and ideas. Orff's musical approach and subsequently the entire Orff-Schulwerk tradition aims for a kind of music that can be described as cross-cultural or bi-historical while coming from the momentary musicality of the individual. Body percussion is also referred to as "elementary instruments" in the literature, providing an opportunity for momentary musical expression and active musical experience (Sangiorgio, 2022). According to Orff, music cannot exist by itself, but is related to movement, music and speech. Everyone has the right to a musical experience, regardless of musical ability. Music can only be experienced through active musical activity. Listening to music alone is not enough, so children using the Orff method have an immediate opportunity to create their own music using Orff instruments (Frazee & Kreuter 1997). The importance of musical motor education in education is special and creative, based on the most modern and advanced cognitive principles of child psychology, music pedagogy, kinesiology and aesthetic education. It is a pedagogical system of approaching music and movement through personal experiential experience, exploration, observation and creative improvisation. School education has the obligation to cultivate and to activate in the developing person all those abilities which are necessary for his evolutionary path such as initiative, imagination and creativity (Sangiorgio, 2010).

REFERENCES

- Agalianou, O., & Alexiadi, K. (2013). The Hellenic Orff-Schulwerk Association (ESMA): Historical Review, Evolution and Prospects. Special Issue 5 (2) 2013. Retrieved from <http://approaches.primarymusic.gr>
- Comeau, G. (1995). *Comparing Dalcroze, Orff and Kodály: Choosing your approach to teaching music*. Centre franco-ontarien de ressources pédagogiques, Ottawa.
- Dogani, K. (2022). The Orff Music and Movement Education as a Starting Point and a Destination. O. Agalianou
- Frazee, J., & Kreuter, K. (1997). *Discovering Orff: A Curriculum for Music Teachers*. Schott
- Georgopoulou, A. (2020). Detection of approaches to the music education course in primary education: the case of music education teachers in the prefectures of the Western Greece Region. University of Patras. Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences. Department of Education Sciences and Early Childhood Education.
- Kokkidou, M. (2015). *Teaching music*. FagottoBooks
- Mason, J. (2002). 'Qualitative Interviews: Asking, Listening and Interpreting' in T. May (ed.) *Qualitative Research in Action*, London: Sage.
- Ministry of Education, Lifelong Learning and Religious Affairs, Pedagogical Institute, UNIFORM FRAMEWORK FOR THE PROGRAM OF MUSIC STUDIES (DEPPS) Official Gazette: 1366, vol. B' 18-10-2001 / 1373, vol. B', 18-10-2001 / 1374, vol. B', 18-10-2001 / 1375, vol. B', 18-10-2001 / 1375, vol. B', 18-10-2001 / 1376, vol. B', 18-10-2001
- Kotzian, R., & Vallejo, P. (2018). *Orff-Schulwerk Rediscovered - Teaching Orff: Music and Teaching Models Book*. Schott
- Saliba, K. (2017). *Orff and the Elements of Music: A Straightforward Approach for Using Orff in Your Classroom*. Heritage Music Press
- Sangiorgio, A. (2022). Creative group work as a central pedagogical strategy in the Orff-Schulwerk approach. *Orff-Schulwerk International*, 1(1), 27-33.
- Sangiorgio, A. (2010). *Orff Schulwerk as Anthropology of Music*.
- Sergi, L. (1993). *Music Education as a factor in the formation of the child's personality: Interdisciplinary teaching with a focus on music for children aged four to six years*. Did. Dissertation Pedagogical Department of Kindergarten Teachers. University of Athens
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research*. Newbury Park. CA: Sage Publications.